

## QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE TEACHER'S PERFORMANCE IN PRIVATE AND PUBLIC SECTOR SCHOOLS: A DEVELOPING COUNTRY'S EXPERIENCE

Farah Khan<sup>1</sup>, M. S. Omar Fauzee<sup>2</sup>, Yaakob Daud<sup>3</sup>

School of Education and Modern Languages, CAS, Universiti Utara Malaysia, MALAYSIA.

<sup>1</sup> farahazam75@yahoo.com, <sup>2</sup> mohdsofian@uum.edu.my, <sup>3</sup> yaakob@uum.edu.my

### ABSTRACT

*Indeed, the key role of education in prompting societal development is crystal clear and always indisputable. However, more important is quality education which increases productivity. Education right from primary to tertiary and higher levels is equally important. The main objective of this study is to understand whether there is any difference in teacher's performance working in private school and public school in the context of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP), Pakistan. This study based on qualitative approach using documents analysis, secondary data sources, where, mainly materials collected from the previous studies, Government of KP and Pakistan surveys. It has been concluded that though the government making efforts to improve quality and standard of public sector school but still relatively behind the private sector school in terms of quality education. It is evident that every year private school securing the maximum top position in the matric examination. It implies that teacher's performance in the private school is far better as compared to the public school teacher's performance. The finding of this study expected to contribute to the literature on the public-private sector schools performance in the country. The findings suggest that the government of KP needs to pursue check and balance, because without monitoring and strict policy, the quality and standard of education is not achievable.*

**Keywords:** Education, Teacher's Performance, Private School, Public School, KP-Pakistan

### INTRODUCTION

Education is a personality building procedure, increasing one's character and making him/her sensible, efficient, open-minded and intelligent. World is constantly changing and emerging, It dictates modifications in every field counting education. Education is watched as a tool to develop the reasoning qualities, patience and understanding of people, it should get ready the younger generation to know and face the actualities of globalization. Education plays a very important role in human capital creation; it increases the efficiency and competence of individuals and thus creates skillful manpower. The studies of Farah et al., (2014; 2015) reveals that prosperity of a nation depends upon the progress of education system. Great leaders and philosophers have been emphasizing on the importance and need of education since longtime. Every society and every civilization laid a premium on education.

The Education Sector in Pakistan suffers from inadequate economic input, low levels of efficacy for execution of programs, poor quality of administration, management, watching, checking, teaching and supervision and as a result, Pakistan has one of the lowermost rates of literacy in the world. In OECD (2005) this point is discussed that the plan of worker's appraisal in secondary schools and its response play an important role in emerging whole education system.

The Government of Pakistan, Economic Survey (2013-14:147) shows that

*“Education is a form of learning in which the knowledge, skills and habits of group of people are transferred from one generation to the next generation through teaching, training, or research. Education is a social instrument through which man can guide his destiny and shape his future. A knowledge society can be built by making the education process more effective which in turn provide foundations for socio-economic development of the country. Hence, the role of education has become centric to develop knowledge economy since literate and skilled citizen play a pivotal role in the development/prosperity of the country”.*

They further maintains that to achieve the aim of educated and skillful human resource, enormous investment in education is required because education would certainly support the stakeholders in altering their attitude to get largest literacy rate. Therefore, both private and public development sectors are required to satisfy their corporal and physical social responsibilities in education sector in order to improve human capital formation in Pakistan. Many previous studies including mentioned that education play significant role in promoting socio-economic development a country (Azam & Ather, 2010; 2015; Azam *et al.*, 2014).

Training plays an important and successful role in polishing the quality of education in schools. According to Chau (1996), the quality of education depends upon the quality of teachers, especially in the early stages of education when the pupils are at an initial age, and particularly in the rural areas. According to Stronge and Tucker, (2003) the educational transformation struggles are useless without capable and talented teachers and their evaluation which is necessary for the appropriate guidance of students learning. If teachers are encouraged then they will create effective learning and learning of students is the final goal of school (Craig, 2011). Further he favored the opinion that the response of students is an actual measure of teacher's performance.

In Pakistan parents shifted their children's from government schools to private schools due to the poor and negative experiences of government schools. Presentation evaluation practices seem to be parallel in both public and private schools of Pakistan; however there is a clear difference between the both brooks of educational institutions. Sir Michael Barber (2010) pointed out in his study about the bad experiences of government schools like poor facilities, learning outcomes and locations which lessen parents' interest for government schools. The government school teachers getting higher salaries and government schools using double the resources to work as compared to private schools but the education levels of children in private schools continuously to be much better than public sector schools.

In a report of Knacademy (2014) that Pakistan's education system is based on imbalanced lines. Education system is different in private and public sector. This makes a sort of inequality amongst people and dividing them into two sections. Such a distressed structure is a basic reason of high dropout rates and high illiteracy rate in Pakistan in rural areas and public school also. Moreover the distribution of funds for education is only 2.0 % of the total GDP and it's very low. Furthermore, the quality of education in the government schools is well below standard and also the teachers in public schools are also not well trained. So the people try their luck in educational system who do not get job in any other sector.

Related to the schools performance in most of the prior comparative study, the scholars matched the performance of private and public schools by taking different factors and measures. Teacher absenteeism and the quality of school amenities and facilities are the main issues and factors which are connected to the performance of students. According to Suryadarma *et al.* (2006) quality of school facilities definitely sound effects on school

performance and presentation, although absenteeism of teacher is also affect the school performance related to school administration and management. Furthermore, Rehman and Begum(2013)explicate in their study that committed and effective administration improves the school efficiency, competence, productivity and teacher's instructional abilities and skills. Reforms in education sectors cannot flourish without qualified and well trained teachers as well as without assessment and evaluation of teachers who are supervising the students and are accountable for education of their students (Stronge & Tucker, 2003; Khan *et al.*, 2014).

Generally, teacher's performance observed through their products in the form of student pass/fail, grading or marks. Though, both private and public sectors schools are busy in the provision of education in Pakistan, whereas the structure in both private and public schools vary from each other in terms of salary, job security and qualification etc. And so, it is imperative to explore the differences and similarities in the school teacher performance at private and public schools in Pakistan. Though role of the teachers both in private and public schools are highly important, however the structure of public and private sector school are different in many aspects such as in term of salary package, job security, criteria of appointments, pensions and so. Therefore, the main objective of this study is to understand and highlight the differences in teaching performance in term of student's quality and grades in KP-Pakistan. To the best of the researcher's knowledge, this is a pioneer survey study on the comparison between public and private sectors school education in KP-Pakistan. It is expected that the outcomes of the present study will not only guide the management authorities for promoting education in the country, while it will also contribute to the literature on the subject under the study.

## **LITERATURE REVIEW**

The existing literature on the comparison between public sector school and private sector schools are seemingly very limited at global level in general and with reference to Pakistan in particular.

Several prior studies provide evidence on the relative usefulness of public versus private schools in developing countries is that the foretold performance of students in private schools is higher than foretold performance in government schools (Cox & Jimenez, 1991; Jimenez *et al.*, 1991; Kingdon, 1996).

However, the study of Jimenez and Lockheed (1995) matching public and private schools and stated that private schools in USA enhanced students' performance as considered by standardized test of spoken and mathematical skills. And it was also suggested that ordinary student presentation was better in private than public schools. According to Iqbal (2006) in a comparative study that teachers in private schools use more than one teaching methods and techniques and private schools supply more instructional material for teaching, , art and science exhibition, laborites, organize more co-curricular activities, as compared to public schools. The study of Liaqat (2009) observed that quality of private schools teaching is better than public schools and the teachers of private schools prepared a complete lesson plans before teaching.

Teachers of government school are trained but the authorities and management does not give the facility of audio visual aids to improve student's performance, and even most of the public schools do not have the facility of black boards and they use any board fixed with the help of closet. But in private schools the teachers have the facility to use different charts, models, computers as audio visual aids and pictures etc. And also in private schools there is only 25 students given to the teachers in class room while in public schools there are mostly around 50 students to the teacher in a class room. So the teachers of private school can easily

handle and give more consideration to all students. Usually in public schools do not arranged co-curricular activities while the Private school teachers have the opportunity to display their competences in different co-curricular activities and these activities are arranged by the administration of private schools and also the Private school principals- head masters have considerable concept and ideas for the upgrading of their schools performance concerning to these issues as compared to public principals- head masters (Tariq *et al.*, 2012; Khan, 2012).

Ejaz *et al.* (2012) conducted a study on Punjab province of Pakistan and in this study they were searched four most important motives for emerging of private schooling in Punjab. These are education of parents, Income of the families, English as a medium of instruction in private schools, distance of public school from the houses these are the main reasons to increase up the trend of private schooling. In the study of Alderman *et al.* (2001), analyzed the private school quality in South Asia by primary data and the study examined that most of the parents are in favour of private schooling, even lowliest and poorest parents send their children in private schools. Furthermore the study locates proofs and evidence of advanced mathematics and language successes in private schools as compared to public schools in Pakistan. Aslam (2007), Das *et al.* (2006) and Khan and Kiefer (2007) by using primary data on private school students in Pakistan and also find that the students in private schools in Pakistan have higher and upper examination scores. Similar, Shabbier (2014) carried out a study to compare or liken the performance, successes and efficiency of public vs. private primary schools in rural areas of Azad Jammu & Kashmir. A survey was conducted and questionnaires were distributed for 4 stakeholders, Head Master, teachers, parents and students to check the performance of both government and private schools. Major differences show in findings that the Private schools performance is better than government or public schools.

## **MATERIALS AND METHOD**

As clear from the nature of the study this study is based on qualitative approach using documents analysis and also secondary data sources. Where, mostly materials have been gathered from the prior relevant studies, reports, and Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and national (Pakistan) surveys. Based on these data and information an exploration and descriptive analysis have been conducted in order to achieve set of objective.

## **FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

Evidently in the rural areas, nearly 74 % students goes to government schools whereas 26 % students goes to private schools comprising Madrasah etc., while the data shows that in urban areas 41% goes to the public schools while 59 % students attend private schools comprising Madrasah etc in Pakistan. However, in term of contribution, the private sector school is contributing very low as compared to other countries in the region (Government of Pakistan, Economic Survey, 2013-14). According to the ASER (2013) and Government of Pakistan (2013-14) in 138 rural districts of Pakistan, there are almost 3959 government and 1694 private schools. It has been observed that in general teacher attendance in public schools found was 87%, while in private schools it is found was 93% in Pakistan. Student attendance in public schools recorded at 85% while it was 89% in private schools. Though, 34% teachers of public schools have completed graduation while this ratio is recorded of 39% teachers of private schools. However, it has been seen that relatively more public school teachers hold M.Ed. degree compared to private school teachers in Pakistan. The data shows that 17% teachers of public schools hold M.Ed. while this ratio is only 11% private school teachers. Tuition fee in public school is less as compared to private school, as about 47% of

all private schools charging tuition fee as compared to 24% charging by of all public school in the country.

It is found the after studying various previous studies, and reports which reveals that performance of teachers in private schools are relevantly better than the government schools in Pakistan. Results of this study are similar to some prior studies, for example, the study of Aslam (2007) finds that those girls do have significantly and considerably poorer approach to private schools than do boys. The results also reveal that private schools are undeniably of better quality as compared to the government schools. The results of Khan et al. (2014) s study indicates that performance assessment system in private schools is relatively more effective and constructive than that of public schools in Pakistan, however, classroom environment of public schools is improved than private schools in the country. In a similar study Amjad and MacLeod (2014) note that affordable or inexpensive private schools in developing countries comprising those of South Asia yield enhanced academic outcomes than public schools. Amjad and MacLeod (2014: 22) concluded that

*“In Pakistan, some 25%–33% of all children now attend private schools. Further, there has been substantial, consistent, developing country evidence that students of affordable private schools outperform academically their counterparts in government schools. This seems to remain true even after account is taken of intellectual ability, home and family characteristics.”*

However, our results are contradictory to the results obtained by Iqbal (2012), where the research find that government schools are more conducive than private schools in Pakistan.

## **CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS**

The main purpose of this study is to explore that is there any difference in the school teacher’s performance in private school and government/public school in KP-Pakistan. After a thorough survey of several pertinent studies on the performances of government schools and private schools teachers’ performance, it is safe to uncover that apparently the school teacher’s performance in private school is relatively more visible as compared to the government schools teachers’ performance in Pakistan. The outcomes of this study likely to help in guiding the education management authorities in order to focus more on the unsatisfactory public sector school performance and probe it root causes in the country.

Moreover, the findings of this study suggest that the policy makers should formulate an effective policy focuses more on the quality and performance of government school teachers. Government school teacher’s promotion must be connected with their yearly performance in term of student pass/fail or marks in the various examinations. Various ministers and high level officer inferences in the recruitment and transfer from one school to another must be banned. Unproductive and less efficient teachers needs to be expel after proper show cause notice and warning, while productive and more efficient teachers must be prompted or rewarded by incentives. Hope all these will improve largely quality of the public sector schools in Pakistan. This study was limited to secondary data sources, so it is suggested for future research that apart from secondary data, primary data should also be used, while using more sophisticated statistical tool for data analysis. Hope the outcomes will give more precise and meaningful results for the betterment of education in Pakistan.



## REFERENCES

- [1] Alderman, H., Orazemb, P. F., & Paternoc, E. M. (2001). School quality, school cost, and the public/private school choices of low-income households in Pakistan. *Journal of Human Resource*, 36, 304-326.
- [2] Amjad, R., & MacLeod, G. (2014). Academic effectiveness of private, public and private-public partnership schools in Pakistan. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 37, 22-31.
- [3] Annual Status of Education Report (ASER). (2013). *Annual report*. Retrieved from <http://www.aserpakistan.org/>.
- [4] Aslam, M. (2007). *The relative effectiveness of government and private schools in Pakistan: are girls worse off?* London: Research Consortium on Educational Outcomes and Poverty (RECOUP) WP07/04, University of Oxford.
- [5] Azam, M., & Ather, M. A. (2010). Role of human capital in economic development: evidence from Pakistan (1961-2009). *Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business*, 2 (4), 220-233.
- [6] Azam, M., & Ather, M. A. (2015). Role of human capital and foreign direct investment in promoting economic growth: evidence from Commonwealth of Independent States. *International Journal of Social Economics*, 42 (2), 98-111.
- [7] Azam, M., Ibrahim, Y., & Bakhtiar, B. (2014). Foreign direct investment and economic growth in Asia. *Actual Problems of Economics*, 11 (161), 58-67.
- [8] Chau, G. (1996). The quality of primary schools in different development contexts. USA: UNESCO, International Institute for Educational Planning.
- [9] Cox, D., & Jimenez, E. (1991). The relative effectiveness of private and public schools: evidence from two developing countries. *Journal of Development Economics* 34, 99-121.
- [10] Craig, W. (2011). *Better teacher appraisal and feedback: Improving performance*. UK: Grattan.
- [11] Das, J., Pandey, P., & Zanoj, T. (2006). *Learning levels and gaps in Pakistan*. Australia: World Bank Discussion Paper series no 4067.
- [12] Farah, K., Fauzee, O. M. S., & Daud, Y. (2014). Teacher training education programme in three Muslim countries-Afghanistan, Iran and Pakistan. *Journal of Education and Human Development*, 3 (2), 729-741.
- [13] Farah, K., Fauzee, O. M. S., & Daud, Y. (2015). Significance of teachers and education in promoting national economic development: a case study of Pakistan. *Asian Social Science*, 11 (12), 290-296.
- [14] Government of Pakistan. (2013-14). *Economic Survey of Pakistan*. Islamabad-Pakistan: Ministry of Finance.
- [15] Iqbal, M. (2012). Public versus private secondary schools: A qualitative comparison. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education*, 6 (1), 40 -49
- [16] Iqbal, Z. N. (2006). *A comparative study of English medium schools and Urdu medium schools of Sialkot City*. Pakistan: Department of Teacher Education, Faculty of Education, Allama Iqbal Open University.

- [17] Jimenez, E., & Lockheed, M. E. (1995). Public and private secondary education in developing countries. *Comparative Study*.
- [18] Jimenez, E., Marlaine, E., Lockheed., & Vicente, P. (1991). The relative efficiency of private and public schools in developing countries. *The World Bank Research Observer*, 6 (2), 205-218.
- [19] Khan, A. E. R., Noreen, S., & Raza, M. (2012). Household choice of public versus private schooling, a case study of Bahawalpur City. *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research*, 11(1), 94–99.
- [20] Khan, M. H. A., Chandio, J. H., & Farooqi, M. T. H. (2014). Comparison of performance appraisal system in public and private schools. *Pakistan Journal of Commerce and Social Sciences*, 8 (1), 272-278.
- [21] Khan, R., & Kiefer, D. (2007). Educational production functions for rural Pakistan: A comparative institutional analysis. *Education Economics*, 15 (3), 327–342.
- [22] Khan, A. (2012). Instructional management of a private and a government secondary school principal in northern Pakistan. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 32 (1), 120–131.
- [23] Kingdon, G. G. (1996). The quality and efficiency of private and public education: A case study of urban India. *Oxford Bulletin of Economics and Statistics*, 58 (1), 57-82.
- [24] Knacademy. (2014). *Flaws of education system in Pakistan*. Karachi: KN Academy.
- [25] Liaqat, S. (2009). Comparison of quality of teaching between government and private schools. Lahore: Division of Education, University of Education.
- [26] Naeem, M. T., Stephen, J., Sohail, M. I., & Muhammad, G. B. (2012). A comparative study of public and private schools head teachers vision for school improvement. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business*, 4, 174–183.
- [27] OECD. (2005). *Teachers matter: Attracting, developing and retaining effective teachers*. France: OECD Publications.
- [28] Rehman, M., & Begum, H. (2013). A study of administrative issues in secondary schools of Quetta. *Social Sciences and Humanities*, 4 (3), 297–306.
- [29] Shabbir, M., Wei, S., Fu, G. Y., Chong, R., Marwat, A. M., Nabi, G., & Ahmed, B. (2014). A comparative study of public versus private primary schools, an evidence from Azad Kashmir (Pakistan Administrative Kashmir). *Journal of Education and Practice*, 5 (9), 154-168.
- [30] Stronge, J. H., & Tucker, P. D. (2003). *Handbook on teacher evaluation: Assessing and improving performance*. Larchmont, NY: Eye on Education.
- [31] Suryadarma, D., Suryahad, A., Sumarto, S., & Rogers, H. F. (2006). Improving student performance in public primary schools in developing countries: Evidence from Indonesia. *Education Economics*, 14 (4), 401-429.